

**Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board
Meeting Minutes
September 11, 2025 – 9:00 a.m.**

Board Members Present:

Christian Bearden
Karen Carter
Lorraine Field
Patrick Fitzhugh (Chair)
Kaaren-Lyn Graves
Scott Holman
Mavrick Knoles
Ginger Lane

Jesús Love
Claudia Reilly
Raghu Santanam
Dean Scheinert
John Soto
Drew Trojanowski
Sam Wolo

Board Members Absent:

Daniel Barajas
Neda Boyce
Kristin Emery
Pearl Esau
Meghan McGilvra

Alison Rapping
Brandon Ramsey
Stephanie Rimmer
Jason Schaffner

Public Attendees:

Eddie Barojas
Erica Bennett
Elissa Black
Elizabeth “E” Cole
Dominic Cota
Sandra Enriquez
Thomas Flynn
Deb Furlong
Alejandro Garcia
Carol Gardner
Samantha Hansen
Matalie Hastings
Mari Hicks
LaSetta Hogans
David Howden
Amanda Keams
Christina Lira
Delsy Maldonado

Hayden Maynard
Krista McGarvey
James Montoya
Gustavo Nava
Betsy Nelson
Jovana Parkhouse
Demitria Robles
Deseret Romero
Wathsna Sayasane
Amy Schofield
Stephen Sparks
Rebecca Tierney
Brenda Urquidi
Stephanie Varela
Jose Vaquera
Davvid Welch
Laura Whitehead

1. Call to Order:

Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board (Board) Chair Patrick Fitzhugh called the September 11, 2025, Board Meeting to order at 9:07 a.m. Roll call was completed and a quorum of 14 members were present.

2. Approval of the May 8, 2025 Board Meeting Minutes:

A motion to approve the May 8, 2025 Board Meeting Minutes was made by Board Member Karen Carter and seconded by Board Member Ginger Lane.

Approved: Christian Bearden, Lorraine Field, Patrick Fitzhugh, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Mavrick Knoles, Jesús Love, Claudia Reilly, Raghu Santanam, Dean Scheinert, John Soto, Drew Trojanowski, and Sam Wolo

Opposed: None

Motion passed

3. Consent Agenda:

Board Chair Patrick Fitzhugh presented the consent agenda, items on the consent agenda are meant for updates and approval only, and they are usually approved with a single vote.

The consent agenda was:

- Sunset Policy 300.308 – Youth Supportive Services
- Adopt new Policy 300.308 – Youth Supportive Services
- Adopt new Policy 300.309 – Supportive Services Categories and Cost Guidelines
- Adoption updates to Policy 900.908 – Eligible Training Provider List

Board Member Christian Bearden made a motion to approve the consent agenda and Board Member Sam Wolo seconded the motion.

Approved: Karen Carter, Lorraine Field, Patrick Fitzhugh, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Mavrick Knoles, Ginger Lane, Jesús Love, Claudia Reilly, Raghu Santanam, Dean Scheinert, John Soto, and Drew Trojanowski

Opposed: None

Motion passed

Scott Holman joined the meeting at 9:15 a.m.

4. Open Meeting Law Update

City of Phoenix (City) City Clerk's Office Management Assistant II Davvid Welch presented an Open Meeting Law (OML) Update to cover key guidelines and Board member responsibilities to ensure compliance with OML. He shared that the Arizona OML is guided by Arizona state law and it promotes open deliberations and proceedings, that decisions are made in public, and encourages public access to governmental processes. OML applies to all public bodies, including City Boards and Commissions and their subcommittees.

Meetings governed by OML are a gathering, in person or through technological devices, of a quorum of members of a public body at which they discuss, propose or take legal action, including any deliberations by a quorum with respect to that action. Meetings can take place through electronic communication. This applies to an exchange of electronic communication among a quorum if the exchange involves discussion, deliberation, or taking action by the body concerning a matter likely to come before the body or an exchange between two members if a quorum is copied, even if no other members respond. A one-way “meeting” through electronic communications can occur if a communication is sent by one member to a quorum of the public body and the communication proposes a legal action.

To follow OML, the public body must provide notice of a meeting and have a publicly posted agenda. They must meet in public and allow the public to attend. They must create and post minutes or create and post a recording of the meeting. Meeting agendas must be posted at least 24 hours in advance of the meeting. The notice must include which body is meeting, the date, time, and agenda and how the public can attend. The body can discuss any item listed on the agenda and act on any item listed for action. They are prohibited to discuss or act on anything not listed on the publicly posted agenda. Additionally, the public body cannot discuss or act on anything without a quorum present. If a member leaves the room during the meeting, they cannot count towards quorum.

OML does not give the public the right to speak on agenda items, but the public may expect it. The call to the public is an opportunity for members to comment on a non-agenda item. The body cannot respond or discuss but they can have the speaker fill out a card, impose time restrictions, ask staff to follow up or place on a future agenda, or respond to personal attacks. While public comment is not required, many members of the public may expect it.

Members who wish to communicate information with other members should send it to the Board liaison for distribution. When there is a conflict of interest, they must be declared at the meeting, shared with the Board Liaison in advance and fill out a form announcing conflict.

A statement describing legal actions, minutes, or a recording must be posted to the Web and available to the public within three (3) days of the meeting. Approved minutes must be posted within two (2) days of approval.

Individuals who knowingly violate and any persons who aid, attempt, or agree to aid can be penalized. Penalties may include actions being rescinded, a civil penalty of up to \$2,500, liability for attorney fees, and possible removal from office. Monetary fees cannot be paid by the City. When public body members attend other public meetings, if the member is attending on behalf of themselves, it is best not to introduce them as a member of the public body.

5. ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Fiscal Report Update:

City Deputy Economic Development Director Wathsna Sayasane and City Economic Development Budget Supervisor Gustavo Nava presented a Board Fiscal Update. Wathsna shared that beginning on July 1, 2025, the Board Fiscal Agent changed from the City Human Services Department to the City Community and Economic Development department. Wathsna and Gustavo introduced themselves to the Board and shared their experiences working in the City.

Gustavo shared the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) allocations for PY25/FY 26:

Program	PY23/FY24	PY24/FY25	PY25/FY26
Youth	\$ 3,452,479	\$ 3,019,286	\$ 2,484,997
Adult	3,261,133	2,870,413	2,351,843
DW	3,204,419	2,936,887	2,813,028
RR	100,000	490,080	195,997
Admin	1,102,004	980,732	849,986
Total	\$ 11,120,035	\$ 10,297,398	\$ 8,695,851

He additionally shared the change in allocation over the previous three years. Since PY22/FY23, funding has decreased by \$5,305, 259, which is a decrease of 37.89%.

Wathsna shared information about FY24-25 Youth Workforce Programs. Youth Workforce fundings include:

Workforce Youth Program	Providers	Source of Funds	Budget Allocation	Performance Period	Expenditures*
Elevate EdAZ	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Greater Phoenix Chamber Foundation 	Strategic Economic Development Funds (SEDF – Specialty Funds)	\$150,000	July 1, 2024 – August 31, 2025	\$150,000
Summer Youth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> YMCA Neighborhood Ministries 	General Fund	\$250,000	May 2025 – June 2025	\$368,750
		JP Morgan Chase (philanthropic grant funds)	\$118,750		
WIOA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chicanos por la Causa Jewish Family & Children’s Services Neighborhood Ministries YMCA 	WIOA (Fund 1857 and 1879)	\$3,332,555	July 1, 2024 – June 30, 2025	\$2,355,984 <i>(\$866,925 open POs)</i>
		WIOA Youth-In			\$664,730
		WIOA Youth-Out			\$1,691,254
Total Youth Expenditures					\$2,874,734

Board Member Sam Wolo asked if the allocation from JP Morgan Chase is consistent with previous years. ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Business and Program Manager Deb Furlong said that the grant allocation from JP Morgan Chase is consistent from the last three years. Board Executive Director LaSetta Hogans shared that Board staff partners with the Parks Foundation, a nonprofit supported by the City Parks and Recreation Department, to accept grant funds. Wathсна shared that if the City is going to apply for grants, City Council must approve City staff applying for fund and allowing the City to accept funds.

Wathсна followed up the Board approval of the One-Stop System Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) at the May 8, 2025 meeting. Wathсна shared that on September 3, 2025 the Phoenix City Council approved the MOU and to accept revenue collected through the Infrastructure Funding Agreement (IFA). She shared that eligible expenses that could be paid for using IFA funds include the One-Stop Operator contract, Title IB training services, and VOS greeter contract. Member Jesus Love asked if the IFA includes Title II funds. Wathсна shared that it did. LaSetta shared a timeline for final execution of the MOU/IFA.

Board Member Christian Bearden made a motion to approve the allocation of any of the program income generated from the One-Stop System IFA to the FY 2025-26 budgeted and eligible expenses as presented by staff, and Board Member Ginger Lane seconded the motion.

Approved: Karen Carter, Lorraine Field, Patrick Fitzhugh, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Scott Holman, Mavrick Knoles, Jesús Love, Claudia Reilly, Raghu Santanam, Dean Scheinert, John Soto, Drew Trojanowski, and Sam Wolo

Abstained: None

Opposed: None

Motion passed

6. Board Chair Updates:

Board Chair Patrick Fitzhugh shared that September is Workforce Development Month and that Board staff will share social media posts that can be posted as well as links to posts that can be reposted. Patrick shared that Board members should have received an invitation to the September 16 Community of Practice meeting focused on Artificial Intelligence in Workforce Training hosted at Grand Canyon University. He shared that the October 10 Community of Practice meeting will be focused on the semiconductor industry with more information to be shared in the coming weeks.

Board attendance was shared so the Board could hold themselves accountable. He thanked everyone for prioritizing attending Board meetings.

7. Rapid Response:

ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Project Manager James Montoya shared a presentation about Rapid Response and the services available to employers and employees facing a reduction in force. He shared that services available include job search assistance, layoff aversion programs like incumbent worker training, customized recruiting events, and customized workshops for impacted employees.

Deployment of Rapid Response services are triggered by Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification (WARN) letters, news media stories, and word of mouth. WARN letters are required of businesses employing more than 100 employees and closing a facility of 50 or more workers, discontinuing an operating unit of 50 or more workers, a layoff of 50-499 that constitutes 33% of their total workforce, or a layoff of 500 or more workers at a single site. For job reductions that do not meet the job requirement, they can still qualify for Rapid Response services if they employee less than 100 employees, fewer than 50 employees are being affected at a single site, or if there will be a temporary layoff.

James shared Rapid Response data for the previous fiscal year and the year-to-date:

DATA

FY 24-25 **(July 24-June 25)**

- **22** WARNS
- **2,092** workers
- **7** NON-WARNs
- **412** workers

FY 25-26 **(July 25- Present)**

- **2** WARNs
- **194** workers
- **2** NON-WARNs
- **150** workers

28

Additionally, James shared the industries most affected by the number of layoff events and the number of employees impacted:

INDUSTRIES IMPACTED

FY 24-25 **TOP 5 Layoffs**

1. Healthcare – 6
2. Retail – 6
3. Manufacturing – 4
4. Logistics – 3
5. Advanced Business Services – 2

29

AFFECTED WORKERS

FY 24-25 TOP 5 Layoffs

1. Retail – 1094
2. Healthcare – 901
3. Manufacturing – 665
4. Government – 537
5. Advanced Business Services – 309

30

Board Member Karen Carter asked what healthcare companies used Rapid Response services. James shared that Stewart Medical went out of business and District Medical closed down a facility, affecting over 100 employees.

James shared that the Board can help staff by:

- **Champion Communication:** Share the difference between WARN and non-WARN events with employer networks and encourage businesses to notify Rapid Response early, even when WARN thresholds are not met.
- **Strengthen Employer Connections:** Use employer relationships to connect staff with companies facing layoffs, restructuring, or closures and help staff gain access to company decision-makers so Rapid Response services can be deployed quickly.
- **Advocate for Rapid Response Value:** Reinforce that Rapid Response is not punitive but a business support service that helps employers and workers navigate transition. Include Rapid Response in conversations with local chambers, industry groups, and economic development councils.
- **Support Continuous Improvement:** Provide feedback on how Rapid Response services are being received in the community. Suggest industries or employers where proactive Rapid Response outreach could make an impact.
- **Policy & Resource Alignment:** Ensure Board priorities (layoff aversion, retraining, apprenticeship, sector strategies) align with Rapid Response activities. Explore leveraging Rapid Response events to connect impacted workers with in-demand training and employer pipelines.
- **Visibility & Storytelling:** Join or observe Rapid Response sessions (when

appropriate) to see services in action. Help tell the success stories to employers, job seekers, and community stakeholders.

Board Member Sam Wolo asked if the airport catering company going that was laying off employees was included in the numbers presented. James shared that they were and that they were working with the new airport contractor to connect them to the affected employees.

Karen asked if a company that is reaching out to another company to connect them to their employees to hire them, if they still need to go through the WARN notice. James shared that staff want to know so they can assist the employees. Board Chair Patrick Fitzhugh asked if there were any repercussions for not filing a WARN. James shared that Arizona is not a punitive state and there are currently no repercussions for not filing a WARN notice. Board Executive Director LaSetta Hogans shared that it is a point to share with the state because it is required by law. Board member John Soto shared that he would speak with Department of Economic Security (DES) who can answer any questions related to outcomes if a business does not file a WARN.

Board member Jesus Love asked if staff how current year numbers compare to the previous year. James shared that currently, they are behind the previous year.

8. Monitoring Update:

ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Performance Compliance Manager Laura Whitehead shared the proposed 2025-26 Board monitoring schedule. Over the previous fiscal year, fifteen monitorings were completed with four pending completion. Completed monitoring completed include data validation, Rapid Response, state advocacy, eligible training provider programs, Phoenix Promise, programmatic, and AZQUEST. She shared that the pending items are Apprenticeship, state advocate, fiscal monitoring, and Board recertification. All of these are monitored through the state.

In the current fiscal year, two monitorings have been completed: eligible training providers and the eligible training provider local area. The pending monitoring includes: Eligible training Provider programs, programmatic, Rapid Response, state advocate, and data validation. Previously local areas were responsible for monitoring eligible training providers, but DES is taking that over.

The monitoring plan includes:

- Data Validation
- Rapid Response
- AZ QUEST
- Programmatic
- Eligible Training Providers – Des
- Eligible Training Provider Local Area – DES
- Eligible Training Provider Program – Board
- Fiscal
- WIOA State Fiscal (Adult/Dislocated Worker)

- One Stop Operator

Board Member Dean Scheinert made a motion to approve the WIOA Program Year 25 Monitoring Plan and Board Member Christian Bearden seconded the motion.

Approved: Karen Carter, Lorraine Field, Patrick Fitzhugh, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Scott Holman, Mavrick Knoles, Ginger Lane, Jesús Love, Claudia Reilly, Raghu Santanam, John Soto, Drew Trojanowski, and Sam Wolo

Opposed: None

Motion passed

9. Call to the Public:

- September 14-20 is National Adult Education and Family Literacy Week. Board Member Jesus Love shared that he has a flyer sharing information about Title II services that can be shared with Board members.

10. Future Agenda Items:

- Board Member Jesús Love asked for the Board to be kept informed/updated TSMC job creation and how many residents are being employed, as well as people coming to Phoenix as a result, and the economic impact
- Title II Program information and results

11. Adjournment:

PBWD Board Vice - Chair Patrick Fitzhugh adjourned the meeting at 10:07 a.m.