



**Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board
Executive Leadership Committee Meeting Minutes
December 14, 2023, ~ 3:00 p.m.**

HYBRID MEETING

The meeting of the Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board Executive Leadership Committee was held virtually on December 14, 2023.

Committee Members Present:

Sam Wolo (Chair)	Jesus Love
Patrick Fitzhugh (Vice Chair)	Brandon Ramsey
Allison Rapping	Claudia Reilly
Meghan McGilvra	

Public Attendees:

LaSetta Hogans	Christina Quijada
Hayden Maynard	Deb Furlong
Ariadna Valentin	Jovanna Parkhouse
Laura Whitehead	Mari Hicks
Michelle Gillis	Gordon Innes
Thomas Flynn	James Montoya
Kristen Titus	Eddie Barojas
Jordan Dodeward	Demitria Robles
Rebecca Tierney	David Chavez

Action items taken are noted in **bold** print.

1. Call to Order/ Roll Call:

PBWDB Chair Sam Wolo called the December 14, 2023, Phoenix Business and Workforce Development (PBWD) Board Executive Leadership Committee (ELC) Meeting to order at 3:04 p.m. Roll call was completed, and quorum was met with six members in attendance.

2. Approval of Minutes for ELC June 8, 2023, Meeting Minutes:

ELC member Meghan McGilvra made a **motion to approve minutes for the June 8, 2023, ELC Meeting** and ELC Member Brandon Ramsey seconded.

Approved: Patrick Fitzhugh, Jesus Love, Meghan McGilvra, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, and Sam Wolo.

Opposed: None

Motion passed unanimously.

Alison Rapping joined at 3:08 pm

3. Priority Interventions to meet employers’ workforce needs:

Kristen Titus and Gordon Innes from Bloomberg Associates (BA) shared a presentation that identified priority interventions suggested to meet employer’s workforce needs.

Gordon reviewed the three goals of the workforce strategy implementation plan identified by Bloomberg Associates:

July 2023: PBWDB Implementation plan

Actions	Mo nth 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Month 7	Month 8	Month 9	Month 10	Month 11	Month 12	Month 13	Month 14	Month 15
➡ (1) Take steps to strengthen the workforce development system															
➡ (2) (a) Build insights to inform goals for the workforce development system and investment decisions for the Board and individual organizations															
(2) (b) Report on the PBWDB’s programs’ return on investment and value for money															
(3) (a) Design a model that braids program funding, review and scale															
➡ (3) (b) Help providers, community colleges and others to access additional funding streams															
(4) (a) Create a single front door for young people, job seekers, employers and providers, which builds on (and does not replicate) current digital platforms															
(4) (b) Map career pathways for the largest, growing employers in priority sectors															
(5) Map existing workforce tools and distribute common messaging															
(6) (a) Create a marketing campaign to influence employers’ perceptions about recruiting from hard-to-reach communities															
(6) (b) Create a marketing campaign to promote in-demand occupations and career pathways with hard-to-reach communities															
(6) (c) Explore asking Phoenix’s ‘eds and meds’ anchor institutions to create a program to train and employ hard-to-reach populations															

Kristen discussed the PBWD Board implementation plan. She shared that Bloomberg Associates led a 3-month plan to engage the city’s top employers, define workforce needs, and develop a set of priorities for implementation in 2024, Those priorities include employer engagement, needs assessment, recommendations, and an action plan.

Bloomberg and Associates identified priority sectors with growth opportunities and engaged employers in advanced manufacturing (including semiconductors and aerospace), financial services, business services, life sciences, and technology. To date, BA has engaged in to outreach 20+ companies across sectors, including 13 employers in interviews, four site visits, and 32 executives offered insight into growth targets, hiring needs, and feedback on training and education solutions. From the interviews, 70% of the positions executives were hiring for are entry-level roles and 30% are advanced roles.

Among the city's top employers, few report that they've engaged in and/or leveraged the city's workforce solutions, pipelines, or programs. All employers expressed interest in engaging with the City of Phoenix to define needs, inform solutions, and tap into pipelines and programs to support their growth in 2024.

ELC member, Alison Rapping said there is huge disconnect with what the employers need and what the community is providing and a disconnect with employers knowing where to go. She is working on a corporate initiative that is really working on how to help these corporations to understand where all of these are.

Kristen said that many employers shared they would like a program that would deliver a pipeline of qualified talent, align with business demand, provide visibility, engagement opportunities for employers, and to work with the City to market the program.

Kristen provided six recommendations:

1. Launch scalable "Phoenix Futures" recruitment, training program with employer input.
2. Build 1-2 new, sector specific, customized training programs.
3. Launch "Career Pathways" initiative to incentivize upward mobility, increase retention.
4. Advance campaigns to drive awareness, increase interest and mobilize job seekers around key sectors, job types, and training and education pathways.
5. Build Community of Practice to align employers with local training providers.
6. Utilize philanthropic vehicles to supplement WIOA, fund localized programs.

ELC Member Jesus Love commented that Title II requires partners should be part of this community.

Kristen discussed the distribution of responsibilities and next steps in Quarters 1 & 2 of 2024.

Kristen asked for feedback from the ELC. ELC Chair Sam Wolo asked about "meaningful wage" and the 70/30 slide. Kristen provided a brief answer to the committee regarding the challenges and narratives from employers. Sam said he would like to continue the discussion around what that definition of "meaningful wage" due to the North Phoenix transportation issue.

Gordon mentioned that several employers are losing staff at those hourly rates and are jumping from job to job for an extra 50 cents an hour as well as stability and benefits.

ELC Member Meghan McGilvra mentioned that they are seeing this a lot with bank tellers. If jobseekers can follow a career path upwards, that would be beneficial. Alison shared that research supported a meaningful wage for a single person was \$23/hour and anything below \$20/hour was too little.

Allison Rapping mentioned that they conducted research and found that \$23 an hour if you are a single person, anything under \$20 is a recipe for disaster. The \$23 an hour is the benchmark.

ELC Member Claudia Reilly mentioned that companies are in a slowdown mode right now and a good time for planning and are expecting growth in the second half of the calendar year 2024 or 2025.

4. Steering Committee Check-In:

Each of the three Steering Committee chairpersons provided updates.

Instill Hope – ELC Member Jesus Love reported that the Instill Hope Steering Committee (IHSC) held their first meeting and took time to review the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) and the roles of each one of the four title partners. The IHSC also discussed how to engage and move forward with the strategic plan.

Align Investment – ELC Member Brandon Ramsey reported the Align Investment Steering Committee (AISC) held two meetings. The committee is currently collecting, interpreting, and visualizing the data available to make informed decisions. The AISC is in the discovery phase and trying to map out outcomes and bring them to the other committees, especially career pathways and ensure that the investments align with the other committee members.

National Model for Mobility – ELC Member Meghan McGilvra reported that the National Model for Mobility Steering Committee (NMMSC) had introductions and analyzed the implementation plan and reporting tool. NMMSC is considering data to guide their work.

Sam asked the steering committee chairs to share the information they presented to the ELC to the PBWD Board on January 11, 2024, and share what opportunities, challenges, and dependencies they foresee.

ELC Member Claudia Reilly asked if there are special deliverables that ELC will have to report to City of Phoenix officials that the ELC should prepare

for. Sam shared that reports would be shared quarterly with the first due the first quarter of the year.

Sam reviewed the ELC expectations with the members and asked for any feedback or questions. All members in attendance approved and this information will be shared with the PBWD Board at the next scheduled meeting.

5. Data Validation Audit:

ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Performance Compliance Supervisor Laura Whitehead presented the results of the various audits. The state data validation audit was completed in November 2023, ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix had zero findings. The Department of Labor (DOL) audit noted four areas with findings. Staff are working with Arizona Department of Economic Security (AZDES) to address and correct the issues. The next audit will be the Job Center Certification. A request for identifying three board members by January 26, 2024, to engage and certify that the job centers and affiliate locations to ensure that there is programmatic physical accessibility, continuous improvement, all the measures of WIOA are being met.

ELC Chair Sam Wolo asked Laura if there had been any findings, what that would have looked like. Laura provided a brief overview of audits to the ELC members.

ELC Member Claudia Reilly asked if the audit affects WIOA funding levels. PBWD Board Executive Director LaSetta Hogans shared that WIOA fund levels are based on formula funding, economic conditions, population, and demographics.

6. Board Policy Updates:

ELC Chair Sam Wolo presented two proposed policy updates. Policy 100.108: Allowable Costs suggested changes allow for increased accountability and flexibility to respond to participants needs.

ELC Vice-Chair Patrick Fitzhugh asked about the marketing allowable costs and how the recommendations of Bloomberg are limited by the allowable cost policy. PBWD Board Executive Director LaSetta Hogans replied that in some cases, the PBWD Board can look to other funding sources for activities outside of WIOA allowable costs.

Sam presented the information on 500.502: Supportive Services and asked if there were any questions. He shared that the proposed changes

allowed for accountability and reducing waste and the ties more closely with the participants being served.

Sam asked if the dollar amounts that would be removed from the would be replaced or if amounts were left to the discretion of the provider. LaSetta responded that the allowable cost policy really provides the outlines of what and how the WIOA funds can be used.

PBWD Board Liaison Hayden Maynard informed the committee members policy information is available through the Govenda application. Sam mentioned that if anyone has any questions after review of the information and there were any clarifications that were needed, that it could be done ahead of the next full board meeting on January 11, 2024.

ELC Member Jesus Love made a motion to recommend the proposed policy changes with time for discussion to the PBWD Board. ELC Vice-Chair Patrick Fitzhugh seconded the motion.

Approved: Patrick Fitzhugh, Jesus Love, Meghan McGilvra, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, and Sam Wolo.

Motion passed unanimously.

7. Strategic Meetings Overview:

Rapid Response Technical Assistance Meeting Update

PBWD Board Executive Director LaSetta Hogans provided the methodology for Rapid Response funds being dispersed to Local Boards shared by AZDES at the Rapid Response Technical Assistance meeting. This fiscal year the PBWD Board received \$100,000 to use for layoff aversion events.

WIOA State Plan Development Meeting

ELC Member Claudia Reilly shared she attended the WIOA State Plan Development meeting and that the meeting was very helpful and interesting, but she felt that the employer side was glossed over and how the needs of both employer and workforce worlds can be braided together more effectively.

ELC Vice-Chair Patrick Fitzhugh shared that he felt there is a division in addressing employer and workforce needs and happy that Bloomberg is touting that as well.

ELC Member Jesus Love mentioned that a lot of information was gathered, and it was valuable to make connections to develop a common sense of

what we do among board members, board staff, training providers, and service providers.

US Conference of Mayors Small Business Roundtable

The US Conference of Mayors Workforce Development Council staff organized a small business roundtable that was facilitated by Wells Fargo. ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Workforce Development Supervisor David Chavez attended the event and shared those attendees engaged in conversations related to business growth, economic impact, and the Phoenix Metro Area business ecosystem. The conversations were related to access to human capital, addressing worker shortages, and capitalization and access to financial resources for small businesses which were engaging in driven to address the needs of the in-demand sectors specifically in the semiconductor, healthcare, technology, retail housing and housing skill trades.

8. Matters for Future Discussion:

Sam called for Matters for Future Discussion

- White House Workforce Hub Convening (second or third week of January)
- WIOA Reauthorization

9. Call to the Public and Open Discussion:

ELC Chair Sam Wolo called the public for comment.

LaSetta shared that the Workforce Arizona Council (WAC) issued an invitation for a workforce convening in January at Gateway Community College. There is an RSVP link to attend, and information will be sent out through Govenda.

10. Adjournment:

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made at 4:37 p.m. by ELC Member Jesús Love and seconded by ELC Vice-Chair, Patrick Fitzhugh.

Approved: Meghan McGilvra, Patrick Fitzhugh, Jesus Love, Brandon Ramsey, Allison Rapping, Claudia Reilly, and Sam Wolo.

Opposed: None

All were in favor and the meeting adjourned at 4:37 p.m.