



**Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board
Meeting Minutes
January 24, 2024 – 9:00am**

Board Members Present:

Suzanna Armijo	Meghan McGilvra
Daniel Barajas	Kevin Parker
Nick Bielinski	Brandon Ramsey
Karen Carter	Alison Rapping
Steven Cramer	Jason Schaffner
Patrick Fitzhugh (Vice-Chair)	John Soto
Kaaren-Lyn Graves	Sam Wolo (Chair)
Juvenal Lopez	

Public Attendees:

Nichole Ayoola	Nicole Kelsheimer
Eddie Barojas	Patricia Lakandula
Steven Bennett	Hayden Maynard
Erica Bennett	Ashley Neal
Jesus Bentancourt	Christina Quijada
David Chavez	Nancy Quinn
Elizabeth Cole	Jocelyn Pacheco
Leilani Corral	Jovanna Parkhouse
Jordan Dodeward	Jeanette Perez
Sandra Enriquez	Alexandra Platas
Diana Figueroa	Precious Randolph
Thomas Flynn	Karla Sanchez
Deb Furlong	JoAnn Schavey
Perla Garcia	Amy Schoenfield
Michelle Gillis	Alissa Tenorio
Samantha Hansen	Rebecca Tierney
Tyler Haskell	Ariadna Valentin
Matalie Hastings	Cynthia Vega
Mari Hicks	Laura Whitehead
LaSetta Hogans (Executive Director)	Hugh Wolf
David Howden	

1. Call to Order:

Phoenix Business and Workforce Development (PBWD) Board Chair, Sam Wolo, called the January 24, 2024, PBWD Board Meeting to order at 9:02 a.m. Roll call was completed and a quorum of 14 members were present.



Suzanna Armijo joined the meeting at 9:05 a.m. Kaaren-Lyn Graves joined at 9:09 a.m.

2. Approval of November 9, 2023, PBWDB Meeting Minutes:

PBWD Board Member Jesus Love emailed PBWD Board staff and shared that he would like changes made to item number four and shared that the Instill Hope Steering Committee (IHSC) also discussed the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA), the Workforce System, mandated core partners, the role of the Board, and expanded upon the need to have a required memorandum of understanding in infrastructure planning agreement among the Title II education and adult literacy programs, and the Title IB adult, dislocated worker, and youth programs and also the need to have a client referral system for all WIOA core mandated partners and other partners.

A motion to approve the November 9, 2023, PBWDB Meeting Minutes with suggested edits was made by PBWD Board Member Nick Bielinski and seconded by PBWD Board Member Kevin Parker.

Approved: Suzanna Armijo, Daniel Barajas, Karen Carter, Steven Cramer, Patrick Fitzhugh, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Juvenal Lopez, Meghan McGilvra, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, Jason Schaffner, John Soto, Sam Wolo

Opposed: None

Abstained: None

Motion passed.

3. Priority Interventions to Meet Employer's Workforce Needs:

Kristen Titus from Bloomberg Associates (BA) shared a presentation that identified priority interventions suggested to meet Phoenix employer's workforce needs.

Kristen reviewed the three goals of the workforce strategy implementation plan identified by Bloomberg Associates:

July 2023: PBWDB Implementation plan

Actions	Month 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Month 7	Month 8	Month 9	Month 10	Month 11	Month 12	Month 13	Month 14	Month 15
(1) Take steps to strengthen the workforce development system															
(2) (a) Build insights to inform goals for the workforce development system and investment decisions for the Board and individual organizations															
(2) (b) Report on the PBWDB's programs' return on investment and value for money															
(3) (a) Design a model that braids program funding, review and scale															
(3) (b) Help providers, community colleges and others to access additional funding streams															
(4) (a) Create a single front door for young people, job seekers, employers and providers, which builds on (and does not replicate) current digital platforms															
(4) (b) Map career pathways for the largest, growing employers in priority sectors															
(5) Map existing workforce tools and distribute common messaging															
(8) (a) Create a marketing campaign to influence employers' perceptions about recruiting from hard-to-reach communities															
(8) (b) Create a marketing campaign to promote in-demand occupations and career pathways with hard-to-reach communities															
(8) (c) Explore asking Phoenix's 'eds and meds' anchor institutions to create a program to train and employ hard-to-reach populations															

As part of the PBWDB implantation plan, BA led a 3-month sprint to engage the city's top employers, define workforce needs, and develop a set of priorities for implantation in 2024.

1. Employer engagement
2. Needs assessment
3. Recommendations
4. Action plan

BA identified priority sectors with growth opportunities and engaged employers in advanced manufacturing (including semiconductors and aerospace), financial services, business services, life sciences, and technology. To date, BA has engaged in outreach to 20+ companies across sectors, including 13 employers in interviews, four site visits, and 32 executives offered insight into growth targets, hiring needs, and feedback on training and education solutions. From the interviews, 70% of the positions executives were hiring for are entry-level roles and 30% are advanced roles.

Among the city's top employers, few report that they've engaged in and/or leveraged the city's workforce solutions, pipelines, or programs. All employers expressed interest in engaging with the City of Phoenix to define needs, inform solutions, and tap into pipelines and programs to support their growth in 2024.

Kristen said that many employers shared they would like a program that would deliver a pipeline of qualified talent, align with business demand, provide visibility, engagement opportunities for employers, and to work with the city to market the program.



While less than 15% cited training and education solutions as critical to their pipeline and recruiting efforts, nearly all expressed interest in programs that:

1. Deliver a pipeline of qualified talent;
2. Integrate employer feedback, align with business demand;
3. Provide visibility, engagement opportunities for employers;
4. Optimize for centralized programs vs. 1:1 customized training programs

Kristen provided six recommendations:

1. Launch scalable "Phoenix Futures" recruitment, training program with employer input.
2. Build 1-2 new, sector specific, customized training programs.
3. Launch "Career Pathways" initiative to incentivize upward mobility, increase retention.
4. Advance campaigns to drive awareness, increase interest and mobilize job seekers around key sectors, job types, and training and education pathways.
5. Build Community of Practice to align employers with local training providers.
6. Utilize philanthropic vehicles to supplement WIOA, fund localized programs.

Sam Wolo, PBWD Board Chair shared that Kristen and team with BA are available throughout the term to assist the steering committees as needed.

A motion was made to withdraw the previous motion to adopt the six recommendations was made by PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo and seconded by Nick Bielinski.

A motion to adopt that each committee review and align with one task from the recommendations was made by PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo and seconded by PBWD Board Member Nick Bielinski.

Approved: Suzanna Armijo, Daniel Barajas, Karen Carter, Steven Cramer, Patrick Fitzhugh, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Juvenal Lopez, Meghan McGilvra, Kevin Parker, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, Jason Schaffner, John Soto.

Opposed: None

Abstained: None

Motion passed



4. PBWD Board Policy Update:

PBWD Board Staff Hayden Maynard presented the three proposed policy updates:

- 100.108: Allowable Costs

100.108: Allowable Costs



- Added Steven's Amendment Language: Department of Labor funded projects must include information about federal funding (Pg 3- Section: B. 1. d. i-iii.)
- Marketing specifics: Marketing cannot increase awareness or support of a non-Federal entity (Pg 4 – Section: B. 1. h)
- New Allowable Costs: Included food and beverage for specific WIOA-related expenses (Pg 6 – Section: B. 2. g)
- PBWD Board responsibilities for allowable costs (Pg 6 – Section: C)

Changes are made in accordance with new Federal Training and Employment Guidance Letter (TEGL) and updated the Workforce Arizona Council (State Board) policy

- 200.02 Individualized Career Services

200.02: Individualized Career Services



- Removed the Arizona Career Readiness Language as it is no longer offered and added an example to situations where formal assessment may not be necessary (Page 1, Section IV. Policy, A)
- Combined points detailing services available while developing an Individualized Employment Plan (IEP)(Page 2-3, Section IV, A., 2., a) iii – iv)
- Added workforce preparation activities that should be customized to participants needs (Page 3, Section IV, A., 2., c))
- Removed specific assessment language so assessments can be customized (Page 3, Section IV, B.)

Changes are made in accordance with new Workforce Arizona Council (State Board) policy and program needs



- 500.502 Supportive Services

Commented [HM1]: Add the slides from this presentation for each of the policies.



500.502: Supportive Services

- Updated subrecipient and sub-awardee procurement and reimbursement language (Pg 1 –V. Policy)
- Included new supportive services: electronic devices, food and beverage, and employment documentation (Pg 2 – Work and training related services)
- Updated emergency services to include purchase of a vehicle (Pg 3 –B, 5.)
- Removed costs associated with supportive services to allow for more flexibility (Pg 5-6)

Changes are made in accordance with new Federal Training and Employment Guidance Letter (TEGL) and updated the Workforce Arizona Council (State Board) policy

A motion to approve the PBWDB Board Policy updates was made by PBWD Board Member Daniel Barajas and seconded by PBWD Board Member Brandon Ramsey.

Approved: Suzanna Armijo, Nick Bielinski, Karen Carter, Steven Cramer, Patrick Fitzhugh, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Juvenal Lopez, Meghan McGilvra, Kevin Parker, Alison Rapping, Jason Schaffner, John Soto, Sam Wolo

Opposed: None

Abstained: None

Motion passed.

5. Job Center Certification:

ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Compliance Manager Laura Whitehead shared information regarding the upcoming job center certification. The purpose of the certification of the job centers and affiliate locations to ensure that there is programmatic physical accessibility, continuous improvement, and ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix does business is meeting all the measures of WIOA.

Board members Sam Wolo and Meghan McGilvra volunteered take part in the



certification process which will take 40 hours to complete. The request for one or two more members to participate in the certification process and identified by February 9, 2024. If interested, please submit your name to the PBWD board staff.

PBWD Board member, Steven Cramer volunteered to assist with the job center certification process.

Laura Whitehead shared the sites that would be visited are three comprehensive job centers, two affiliate sites and four youth providers locations.

6. Steering Committee Updates:

PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo asked for each of the three Steering Committee chairpersons provide updates.

National Model for Mobility Steering Committee (NMMSC) – NMMSC Chair Meghan McGilvra reported that the committee held a meeting and identified breakout group designations, convening quarterly to share updates, establishing committee expectations, and monitoring progress towards goals.

Align Investment Steering Committee – AISC Chair Brandon Ramsey reported the committee will be surveying members to determine expertise, and align expertise to actions and assign tasks, revisiting the reporting tool, and propose success measures in order to be more efficient during meetings. AISC members will be guided by member feedback to Chair and Vice-Chair.

7. Future Agenda Items:

Patrick Fitzhugh, PBWD board member requested to take a look at finances and financial reporting.

8. Call to The Public and Announcements:

- Elizabeth Cole with Rio Salado Community College, one of the workforce Title II providers reported on behalf of Jesus Love, PBWD board member who was unable to attend today's meeting. Rio Salado Community College is currently undergoing their request for grant application (RFGA) for Title II, which all Title II programs apply for. The next grant period from 2024-2028, which is a four-year period, but a portion of this will be set aside costs which are used to support Title IB adult and dislocated workers but also youth partners. The set aside costs are part of the contract and are used to support Title II students in the program. Under Title II, they are required to have integrated education and training programs which are part of critical career pathways for basic skills for individuals in our community.



- PBWD Board Executive Director LaSetta Hogans reported City of Phoenix designation as a Workforce Hub would be held on January 25, 2024.
- LaSetta Hogans, PBWD Executive Board Director shared that she serves on the National Workforce Development Council through the National Conference of Mayors and attended the U.S. Conference of Mayor's event in Washington, DC. WIOA is up for reauthorization and passed through the House of Representatives Education and the Workforce Committee and rebranded as A Stronger Workforce for America Act (ASWA), and should be going to the House floor for a vote.

9. Adjournment:

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made at 10:34 a.m. by PBWD Board Member, Kaaren-Lyn Graves, and seconded by PBWD Board Vice-Chair, Patrick Fitzhugh.

Approved: Suzanna Armijo, Daniel Barajas, Nick Bielinski, Karen Carter, Steven Cramer, Nick DePorter, Juvenal Lopez, Meghan McGilvra, Kevin Parker, Emily Paulson, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, Claudia Reilly, Stephanie Rimmer, Raghu Santanam, Jason Schaffner, John Soto, Sam Wolo

Opposed: None

All were in favor and the meeting adjourned at 10:34 a.m.