

**Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board  
Meeting Minutes  
July 13, 2023 ~ 8:30 a.m.**

**HYBRID MEETING**

**Board Members Present:**

Suzanna Armijo	Meghan McGilvra
Daniel Barajas	Kevin Parker
Nick Bielinski	Emily Paulson
Karen Carter	Brandon Ramsey
Steven Cramer	Alison Rapping
Nick DePorter	Claudia Reilly
Patrick Fitzhugh (Vice-Chair)	Raghu Santanam
Kaaren-Lyn Graves	Dean Scheinert
Ginger Lane	John Soto
Juvenal Lopez	Sam Wolo (Chair)
Jesus Love	

**Board Members Absent:**

Scott Holman	Joaquin Rios
Stephanie Rimmer	

**Public Attendees:**

Nichole Ayoola	Grace Koube
Erica Bennett	Hayden Maynard
Steven Bennett	James Montoya
Natalia Carranza	Dustin Panoff
David Chavez	Jovanna Parkhouse
E Cole	Alexandra Platas
Sandra Enriquez	Gabriela Rodriguez
Deb Furlong	Amy Schofield
Perla Garcia	Rebecca Tierney
Samantha Hansen	Brenda Urquidi
Matalie Hastings	Cynthia Vega
Mari Hicks	Laura Whitehead
LaSetta Hogans (Executive Director)	
Amanda Keams	

**1. Call to Order:**

Phoenix Business and Workforce Development (PBWD) Board Chair, Sam Wolo, called the September 14, 2023, PBWD Board Meeting to order at 8:32 a.m.

Roll call was completed and a quorum of 16 members were present. PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo shared that Joaquin Rios had recently been appointed to the Board but was unable to attend the meeting and would be at a future meeting.

**Emily Paulson joined the meeting at 8:35 a.m.**

**2. Approval of July 13, 2023, PBWDB Meeting Minutes:**

**A motion to approve the July 13, 2023, PBWDB Meeting Minutes** was made by PBWD Board Member Nick Bielinski and seconded by PBWD Board Member Nick DePorter.

**Approved:** Suzanna Armijo, Daniel Barajas, Steven Cramer, Patrick Fitzhugh (Vice-Chair), Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Ginger Lane, Jesus Love, Emily Paulson, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, Claudia Reilly, Raghu Santanam, Dean Scheinert, John Soto, Sam Wolo (Chair)

**Opposed: None**

**Abstained: None**

**Motion passed.**

**Meghan McGilvra joined at 8:37 a.m. Juvenal Lopez joined at 8:38 a.m.**

**3. Chair Update:**

PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo thanked PBWD Board Members for participating in the orientation sessions during August and completing post-orientation surveys. He shared that the feedback during orientation and the surveys would be analyzed and incorporated into running the PBWD Board over the next two years.

Sam shared the SWOT analysis completed by PBWD Board Members after orientation. He shared that the goal was to meet in person, but that there would always be a virtual option available to members. He shared the start, stop, continue analysis in alignment with the Board member agreement that they will share at the beginning of each meeting.

**Karen Carter joined the meeting at 8:47 a.m.**

**4. Justice-Involved Programming:**

PBWD Board Member Alison Rapping shared information about justice-involved programming and how businesses can engage with the justice-involved participants. Alison shared that even though there is a labor shortage according

to the US Chamber of Commerce, there are still barriers to being gainfully employed if a participant is formerly incarcerated. This population leads the at a current unemployment rate of 27%. She shared that one out of three people in the United States have a criminal record of some kind, with 20 million of those people having a felony on their record. Less than 10% of the people with a criminal offense (misdemeanor or felony) on their background will never be justice-involved again, but the record will follow them forever. Public prisons cost the United States taxpayers \$80 billion a year.

Alison shared that 25% of Arizonans have an offense on their record, most of them are not violent crimes. There are 34,000 people in Arizona prisons with an institutional cost of \$1.5 billion, which is twice as much as was spent 10 years ago. Costs of incarceration include atrophy of skills, loss of tools to conduct daily tasks, loss of household prosperity, taxpayer burdens, loss of tax-paying citizen while they are incarcerated, and the family financial ecosystem is reduced to a single parent household. When a person is released from prison, they automatically must pay fees, fines, need for upskilling or retraining because of the employment limits for formerly incarcerated people, needing basics to survive, and healthcare costs. If these needs are not addressed, there will be systemic economic repercussions. Alison shared that the four key barriers that often lead to recidivism are employment, transportation, housing, and healthcare.

Alison shared information about fair chance hiring, which will offer formerly incarcerated people a chance to employment. She shared that employers who engage in fair chance hiring have 13% less turnover, with employees that have loyalty and lowering recruiting costs. Alison shared there is a Fair Chance Hiring Symposium on October 5, 2023, to help give information on how to successfully implement a fair chance hiring plan. She shared that the PBWD Board needs to build something that can be a resource to business so they can navigate the different situations that employees face that act as barriers to employment and retention.

PBWD Board Member Jesus Love shared that he would share information with the Board about a formerly incarcerated participant in Title II programming whose testimony was very impactful. PBWD Board Member Raghu Santanam shared information about the Palo Verde Foundation that is working to improve outcomes as they reintegrate into the workforce. PBWD Board Member Karen Carter shared that Terros works with many justice-involved people coming out of prison, but they've been unable to hire people without a background check to be peer support specialist. Alison Rapping shared that she could work with Karen and Terros try to help. Alison offered to speak with anyone who wanted more information. PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo committed to sharing the presentation with his organization. PBWD Board Member Claudia Reilly said she would like to see where the miss is, because her organization is committed to non-discriminatory hiring, and they aren't connected with formerly incarcerated participation. Alison suggested using Pipeline AZ to show the

badge that they are a Fair Chance Employer.

**Kevin Parker joined the meeting at 9:18 a.m.**

## **5. Eligible Training Provider Overview:**

ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Workforce Supervisor Laura Whitehead presented information about the Eligible Training Provider (ETP) program. ETP is a provider who is qualified to receive Workforce Opportunity and Innovation Act (WIOA) Title I funds for approved programs. To be an eligible training provider, the provider must have been in operation at least 12 months, be licensed by Arizona or a federal licensing authority, have a refund and grievance policy, follow non-discrimination and Equal Opportunity (EO) provisions, be able to train populations that face established barriers to employment, and the training programs must result in an industry recognized credential.

The PBWD Board approved target industries are construction, healthcare, advanced business services, manufacturing, and information technology. The ETP list currently has 101 training providers, 73 of which are offering programs in the target industries. There are 254 programs on the ETP list that are in the target industries. PBWD Board Member Alison Rapping asked if ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix had Grow with Google as an approved program. Laura shared that they are not on the Phoenix ETP list. ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Eligible Training Provider Coordinator Mari Hicks shared that Grow with Google is on the Arizona ETP list and the program is online.

Laura shared information about the industry alignment of trainings that participants engaged in for PY 2022, with participants primarily training in healthcare, construction, and non-target industry training. She shared the progress of participants who enrolled in ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix WIOA Title IB programming since July 1, 2023, including how many had completed, exited the program, and how many were still in training.

Mari Hicks shared the roles of the State of Arizona and the City of Phoenix in adding vendors to the ETP list and monitoring programs on the list. The ETP Coordinator reviews programs vendors who want to be added to the list, determine if the vendor is in the Local Area, the programs are aligned with targeted sectors and industry approved certifications, and that the ETP list is shared throughout the Local Area. The ETP Coordinator will monitor the training providers, including information about the programs and the performance of participants in the programs. PBWD Board Member Meghan McGilvra asked if the Board has any accountability with regards to the ETP list. Mari shared that the process for getting onto the ETP list is for the ETP Coordinator to review, then their supervisor would review, and ultimately the PBWD Board Executive Director approves adding programs to the list on behalf of the Board. PWBD

Board Executive Director LaSetta Hogans shared that the Board can change the ETP list. ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Business Services and Workforce Manager Deb Furlong shared that just because a provider is on the Arizona ETP list, they are not necessarily on Local Area ETP list, but when a provider is approved in another Local Area, they could potentially be used by participants in other Local Areas in Arizona, that is dependent on PBWD Board policy. PBWD Board Member Daniel Barajas shared that certain colleges have programs that should be on the ETP list, but they do not enroll because of the process. He suggested survey providers and potential providers to find the roadblocks to enrolling as an ETP.

PBWD Board Member Alison Rapping asked about ETP graduation rates. Mari shared that ETP is required to enter their outcomes into AJC every program year. PBWD Board Member Nick Bielinski asked about data metrics related to credential attainment and the varying time lengths of programs. Laura shared that WIOA monitors participants for a year after they finish training and their employment and wage outcomes after training. LaSetta shared that information regarding participants finishing training can be provided to the Board quarterly, so the information is shared more often than annually.

PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo suggested the Board receive regular reporting on how many participants have started training, how many have completed training, how many have completed any testing necessary to attain a credential, and post-training employment to track Title IB outcomes.

## **6. PBWD Board Bylaws:**

PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo opened the discussion of the Board bylaws, noting the changes to the language around PBWD Board members attending meetings in person and the information about the committees as they are restructured. The PBWD Board Bylaws state that the virtual option is available in for extraneous circumstances when members can't attend in person. The committee language lists the Executive Leadership Committee as the standing committee and contains the definition of steering committees and workgroups, reflecting the more flexible language the PBWD Board members wanted to pursue implementing the new strategic plan.

**A motion to approve the noted changes to the PBWD Board Bylaws** was made by PBWD Board Member Daniel Barajas and seconded by PBWD Board Member Karen Carter.

**Approved:** Suzanna Armijo, Nick Bielinski, Steven Cramer, Nick DePorter, Patrick Fitzhugh (Vice-Chair), Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Ginger Lane, Juvenal Lopez, Jesus Love, Emily Paulson, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, Claudia Reilly, Raghu Santanam, Dean Scheinert, John Soto, Sam Wolo (Chair)

## **7. Steering Committee Discussion:**

PBWD Board Chair Sam Wolo shared information about the intended committees including the Executive Leadership Committee (ELC) and Fiscal Committee (FC). The proposed steering committees for PY 2023-24 would be Instill Hope, Align Investment, and National Model. Each member was asked to determine which committee they feel their skill set aligns with best so they can be on the committee they are most suited for. Each committee is asked to have their first meeting by the November 9 PBWD Board Meeting and select their chair, reflect on the tasks the committees need to take, and confirm their due dates to present at the Board meeting.

PBWD Board Members who have not responded to the post-orientation are requested they respond by September 21, 2023. After September 21, 2023, members will officially be assigned to a committee.

## **8. Matters for Future Discussion:**

- Jesus Love suggested talking about the Title II Program Memorandum of Understanding
- Jesus suggested a presentation on the status of the referral system

## **9. Call to The Public and Open Discussion:**

- E Cole shared that Arizona Title II providers met in Tucson for the Adult Education Institute. She shared that next week is Adult Education and Family Literacy Week. She asked Board members to help remove the stigma of high school equivalency attainment.
- Kaaren-Lyn Graves shared that the Arizona Hispanic Chamber of Commerce was awarded a \$3 million grant from the US Chamber of Commerce Minority Business Development Agency for a capital readiness program.
- LaSetta Hogans shared that Grand Canyon University has a newly renovated facility for CNC machinists which will include pre-apprenticeship programs for CNC machinists, electricians, and semiconductor fabrication technicians. They will have a program on Monday, September 18.

## **10. Adjournment:**

**A motion to adjourn the meeting was made at 10:17 a.m.** by PBWD Board Member, Juvenal Lopez, and seconded by PBWD Board Member, Nick Bielinski.

**Approved:** Suzanna Armijo, Daniel Barajas, Karen Carter, Steven Cramer, Nick DePorter, Patrick Fitzhugh (Vice-Chair), Kaaren-Lyn Graves, Ginger Lane, Jesus Love, Meghan McGilvra, Kevin Parker, Emily Paulson, Brandon Ramsey, Alison Rapping, Claudia Reilly, Raghu Santanam, John Soto, Sam Wolo (Chair)



**Opposed:** None

**All were in favor and the meeting adjourned at 10:17 a.m.**