



**Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board
Program Excellence Committee
Meeting Minutes**

**Virtual Meeting
April 1, 2021
9:00 a.m.**

Members Present:

Latasha Causey, Chair
Daniel Barajas, Vice Chair
Erick Garcia, Vice Chair
Edward Abramowitz
Michelle Jameson
Melissa Trujillo
Samantha Hansen
Stacie Garlieb

Committee Members Absent:

Dean Van Kirk
Meghan McGlivra

Public Attendees:

LaSetta Hogans PBWDB Executive Director)	Ricardo Duran
Christina Edwards (PBWDB Liaison)	Demitria Robles
Nicholas Bielinski	Gina Harper
Kweilin Waller	Hayden Maynard
Laura Whitehead	Reeta Devi
Silvia Valadez Barba (PEC Administrative Support Staff)	

1. Call to Order / Roll Call:

Latasha Causey, Program Excellence Committee (PEC) Chair, called the April 1, 2021 meeting to order at 9:02 a.m. Roll call was completed, and a quorum was present.

2. Approval of March 4, 2021 Meeting Minutes:

Latasha Causey, Program Excellence Committee (PEC) Chair requested a motion to approve the March 4, 2021 PEC Meeting Minutes. PEC Member, Edward Abramowitz moved to make an amendment to the minutes by adding his name to the

future discussion section of the minutes in the sub-group item. **A motion to approve the March 4, 2021 minutes to include the addition of Edward Abramowitz name to the minutes future discussion section** was made by PEC Member Melissa Trujillo, and seconded by PEC Member, Michelle Jameson.

Approved: Latasha Causey, Erick Garcia, Daniel Barajas, Michelle Jameson, Melissa Trujillo, Edward Abramowitz, Samantha Hansen and Stacie Garlieb.

Opposed: None

Motion passed unanimously

3. New Members Introduction:

PEC Chair, Latasha Causey wanted to introduce two new committee members, but they were not present at the meeting. New members will be introduced at a future committee meeting.

4. Communications Plan:

Nicholas Bielinski, Communications and Outreach Committee (COC) Chair provided an update on the initiatives that the COC is working on and shared that the focus of the COC Communications Plan is to highlight what the organization is doing, increase marketing and social media branding of the ARIZONA@WORK events and to engage employers. Platforms like Twitter and LinkedIn are being used to accomplish this. One of the goals of the Communications Plan is to increase traffic to the ARIZONA@WORK website. From a metrics standpoint, the COC is actively tracking internet hits, for example who is going to the events page and to specific dashboards. There has been marketable progress in the amount of traffic to the ARIZONA@WORK website. However, the COC would ask the PEC members engage the social media platforms and spread the word on the various ARIZONA@WORK events and opportunities. Nicholas Bielinski welcomed questions from the PEC members. The PEC Vice-Chair, Daniel Barajas thanked Nick for the update and shared that many of the PEC's scorecard goals and strategies hinge on marketing and creating awareness about ARIZONA@WORK. He invited Nick and the COC to collaborate with the PEC in the future.

5. Federal Metrics Overview:

PEC Chair, Latasha Causey, invited Ricardo Duran, Data and Research Manager with the ARIZONA@WORK, City of Phoenix, Human Services Department to provide an overview of the ARIZONA@WORK federal metrics. He shared that the intent of the overview is to go more in-depth on the data that is presented to the PEC on a quarterly and annual basis. He reviewed and identified the individual metrics, their data sources and the time frames that they include. Additionally, Ricardo provided the

PEC a visual iteration of the time frames in which the metrics are being recorded. He further shared that the individual metrics ceilings are based on a negotiated measure with the Department of Economic Security (DES). Thus, whether a program metric goal classified is failing, acceptable or passing, it is based on this negotiated performance metric ceiling. The enrollment metric is not a DES metric but a City of Phoenix (COP) ARIZONA@WORK performance metric and is defined to be as any active participant during the current program year. He also went over the employment rate & wages metric and finalized his presentation by reviewing the measurable skills gain and credentials metrics.

Annual Reporting Time Frames Program Year 2020 – 21

Program Year 2020-21	Data Source	Time Frame
Program Enrollment	AJC	Program Year 20-21
	(Staff Recorded)	July 2020 – June 2021
2nd Quarter Employment	State Wage Data	Program Year 19-20
	(Auto Recorded)	July 2019 – June 2020
4th Quarter Employment	State Wage Data	Calendar Year 2019
	(Auto Recorded)	January – December 2019
Median Earnings	State Wage Data	Program Year 19-20
	(Auto Recorded)	July 2019 – June 2020
Credential Attainment	AJC	Calendar Year 2019
	(Staff Recorded)	January – December 2019
Measurable Skill Gains	AJC	Program Year 20-21
	(Staff Recorded)	July 2020 – June 2020

Annual Performance Time Frames Program Year 2020-21 July 1, 2020 - June 30, 2021

Program Year 2020-21: July 1, 2020 - June 30, 2021																													
2019												2020												2021					
Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun
												2020-21 Program Year																	
												Enrollments																	
												Employed in 2nd Quarter after Exit																	
												Employed in 4th Quarter after Exit																	
												Median Earnings (2nd Quarter after Exit)																	
Credential Rate																								Measurable Skills Gain					

Negotiated Performance Metrics

Measure	Adult	Dislocated Worker	Youth
2nd Quarter Employment 07/01/19 – 06/30/20	67.20% (60.48%)	75.30% (67.77%)	71.30% (64.17%)
4th Quarter Employment 01/01/19 – 12/31/19	65.2% (58.68%)	72.3% (65.07%)	67.00% (60.30%)
Median Earnings 07/01/19 – 06/30/20	\$5,850.00 (\$5265.00)	\$8,646.00 (\$7781.40)	\$4,500.00 (\$4050.00)
Credential Attainment (CA) 01/01/19 – 12/31/19	71.10% (63.99%)	70.00% (63.00%)	44.00% (39.60%)
Measurable Skill Gains (MSG) 07/01/20 – 06/30/21	59.20% (53.28%)	50.00% (45.00%)	52.80% (47.52%)

Passing	At or Exceeding Negotiated Value
Acceptable	90-99.9% of Negotiated Value
Failing	Below 90% of Negotiated Value

Employment Rate & Wages

Quarterly employment, after exit comes from state wage data

- **Q2 Employment Rate:** 6-months after exit

$$\left(\frac{\text{Employed 6-months after exit}}{\text{All Participants Exited}} \right)$$

Program Year 19/20

- Wage data for **Median Wage** metric also collected at Q2

- **Q4 Employment Rate:** 12-months after exit

$$\left(\frac{\text{Employed 12 Months after exit}}{\text{All Participants Exited}} \right)$$

Calendar Year 2019

Notes:

- Only considers those who received training or career services
- Those who only received information not included
- Employed at Exit entered by Staff

MSGs & Credentials

MSGs and Credentials indicate success in Training Programs

- **Measurable Skills Gain (MSGs):**
 - Educational Functioning Level Increase
 - High School Diploma/Equivalent Attained
 - Transcript/Report Card (12 credits attained)
 - Satisfactory Progress Report (for Established milestone)
 - Successful Passage of a Required Exam
- **Credential Attainment (CA):**
 - Industry recognized credential / license / certificate
 - High School Diploma/Equivalent (if employed or continuing education within 1 year)

6. **PEC Scorecard Review:**

PEC Chair, Latasha Causey invited Vice-Chair, Daniel Barajas to share any PEC Scorecard updates from last month's PEC meeting. Vice-Chair, Daniel Barajas recommended opening the discussion to the PEC scorecard team leaders. PEC Chair, Latasha Causey invited PEC Scorecard Team Leader, Edward Abramowitz to provide an update on behalf of his team. PEC Scorecard Team Leader, Edward Abramowitz shared that since the last meeting, there are no additional updates, and a follow-up meeting will be scheduled to determine further changes, edits and updates. PEC Chair, Latasha Causey invited PEC Scorecard Team Leader, Michelle Jameson to provide an update on behalf of her team. PEC Scorecard Team Leader, Michelle Jameson shared that they were able to make significant progress the last time they met, and a follow-up meeting is pending. PEC Chair, Latasha Causey invited PEC Scorecard Team Leader, Erick Garcia to provide an update on behalf of his team. He shared that there are no recent updates. His team is currently waiting on some data points from Data and Research Manager, ARIZONA@WORK, City of Phoenix, Human Services Department, Ricardo Duran before they can further assess the next best course of action. He is hoping to have an update by the next committee meeting.

7. **PEC Report Form:**

PEC Chair, Latasha Causey, recapped what will be included on the PEC report form that is sent monthly to the ELC and PBWD Board.

8. **Matters for Future Discussion:**

- PEC Vice-Chair, Daniel Barajas shared that given that the PEC is getting hard program data on a quarterly basis, it would helpful to provide a forum during the PEC meetings to the City of Phoenix ARIZONA@WORK program providers, to hear anecdotally from them.

9. Call to the Public and Open Discussion:

- PEC Member, Stacie Garlieb recognized, PEC Chair, Latasha Causey, for all her work with Junior Achievement Arizona. On Friday, March 26, 2021, Latasha Causey was one of the kick-off expert presenters for a 90-day Junior Inspire virtual event; she did a great job in presenting herself and representing PBWDB. PEC Member Stacie Garlieb will also be presenting at the event. She is leading a resume workshop.

10. Adjournment:

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made at 9:54 a.m. by PEC Member Michelle Jameson and seconded by PEC Member Stacie Garlieb.

Approved: Latasha Causey, Erick Garcia, Daniel Barajas, Michelle Jameson, Melissa Trujillo, Edward Abramowitz, Samantha Hansen and Stacie Garlieb.

Opposed: None

Motion passed unanimously